

Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

**Annie Crowley, Oona Brooks
(University of Glasgow)
and Nancy Lombard
(Glasgow Caledonian University)**

COPYRIGHT NOTICE

The Authors assert their right under the Copyright, Design and Patents Act, 1988 to be identified as the author of this work. Permission is granted to reproduce any part or all of this report for personal and educational use only. Commercial copying, hiring or lending is prohibited.

Copyright © Authors 2014

CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
INTRODUCTION	6
FOOTBALL AND DOMESTIC ABUSE	7
SCOTLAND	7
ENGLAND AND WALES	13
FOOTBALL AND OTHER FORMS OF VIOLENCE	16
OTHER SPORT AND DOMESTIC ABUSE	19
OTHER SPORT AND VIOLENCE	20
ALCOHOL	22
MAKING THE LINKS BETWEEN DOMESTIC ABUSE AND FOOTBALL	24
MASCULINITY AND VIOLENCE	24
CREATING MASCULINE IDENTITIES THROUGH FOOTBALL	25
SEXISM WITHIN FOOTBALL	26
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	28

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

- Tackling domestic abuse is a key priority for the Scottish Government and its partners. There is evidence of a correlation between the occurrence of certain football matches in Scotland and increased reports of domestic abuse. There is, however, limited evidence that explains this link. This literature review was commissioned by the Scottish Government to examine existing evidence about the relationship between domestic abuse and football.

Football and domestic abuse

- There are very few studies in the Scottish and wider UK context that specifically address the relationship of football to domestic abuse.
- The studies that do exist mainly compare prevalence of domestic abuse (as recorded either by police, other emergency services, or hospital accident and emergency departments) on the days that football games take place with various comparators. All of these studies show what appears to be a link between domestic abuse and football.
- Existing studies within the Scottish context are all quantitative analyses, based upon incidents reported to the police. These studies found that relative to various comparators, there was an increase in recorded domestic abuse incidents on the day that Old Firm fixtures were played. This was reported as being between 13% and 138.8%, depending on a number of variables: the day of the week the match took place; the comparator day / event; and the salience / outcome of a match.
- The studies that used other football matches as a comparator found examples of apparent relationships between recorded domestic abuse incidents and the existence of the football match. However, these were generally less pronounced patterns, and smaller increases.
- Caution should be exercised in interpreting the findings of quantitative studies that document a correlation between domestic abuse and football. **Specifically, correlation should not be interpreted as causation.** Findings may be impacted upon by the times of day measured, and whether matches

took place at weekends where both alcohol consumption and reports of domestic abuse made to the police are known to increase substantially.

- Caution should also be exercised regarding the use and interpretation of police recorded crime and complaints figures, and crime surveys, as these do not always provide a reliable measure due to the methodological issues associated with collection and recording.
- Despite the limitations of these studies, they do demonstrate a relationship between the days of certain football matches (particularly Old Firm fixtures), and the number of recorded domestic abuse incidents. However, the nature and characteristics of these domestic violence offences are not known, nor who reported them, the gender of the perpetrator and victim, or whether they were repeat offences.
- There is no qualitative research exploring the perspectives of the victims, perpetrators or practitioners in Scotland. This is a significant omission in existing research evidence.

Football and other forms of violence

- Analysis by the Scottish Government (2011) shows that levels of offending (including domestic abuse, antisocial behaviour, violence and bigotry) relative to attendance at big profile football matches in Scotland, are low.
- However, there was an increase across all four of these types of offending, on the days of Old Firm fixtures. The biggest increase in offending was observed in relation to violent offending, which increased by half, at weekends where Old Firm fixtures were held. By contrast, reported incidents of domestic abuse increased by a third at weekends where Old Firm fixtures were held.
- Violence in Scottish football is not limited to between the supporters, but also occurs on the field, and has led to arrest and prosecution.
- Much of the existing football research in the UK has a focus upon supporters, and neglects to fully explore the work of the police and police culture in relation to football spectator culture and violence.
- The concept of 'permissions' in football related violence has been discussed by several authors, who suggest that by failing to sanction certain violent behaviours or violent ideology, it is effectively a permission for this violence to take place.

Sport and domestic abuse

- In the UK and elsewhere increased reports of domestic abuse are also associated with sports other than football, including rugby and American football.
- Research suggests that the salience and / or outcome of a game can have an effect upon domestic abuse, with particularly important games, or those against a traditional rival associated with higher recorded rates. Several studies suggest that it is unexpected outcomes that may be associated with increased domestic abuse.

Sport and violence

- Some studies have found an increase in violent offending related to the outcome of a game. For example, winning has been attributed to an increase in self-confidence, assertiveness, patriotism and alcohol consumption.
- Research suggests that the televised viewing of sports where violence takes place but is non-scripted¹ (such as boxing, football and hockey) may lead to greater hostility and increased violent outcomes in spectators than sports where it is scripted (such as professional wrestling).

Alcohol

- Alcohol is a feature of both football spectatorship and sponsorship, and it has also been identified as a contributory factor in domestic abuse.
- Where research studies have documented an increase in reports of domestic abuse at the time of football matches, this increase is heightened when matches occur at weekends.
- Alcohol consumption has been found to increase at weekends, during the summer, and on public holidays, which also has relevance for the timing of big sporting events.
- Alcohol is clearly shown by research to be one of several important factors that increase the risk of violence against women. However, there is no

¹ Scripted violence in sports refers to sports where violent actions are those which are practiced and choreographed before the competition. Non-scripted violence in sports refers to actions that are performed as reactions to unplanned actions during the course of a competition or game (Westerman and Tamborini, 2010; Johnson and Schiappa, 2010).

evidence to suggest that alcohol causes domestic abuse; the relationship between alcohol and domestic abuse is complex and multi-dimensional.

- It is important not to view alcohol as an excuse for ‘losing control’ and therefore perpetrating domestic abuse.

Making the links between football and domestic abuse

- Domestic abuse is widely understood to be a gendered phenomenon. It is experienced primarily, although not exclusively, by women and perpetrated mainly by men. This gendered understanding of domestic abuse is consistent with the UN definition of violence against women and the Scottish Government’s approach to domestic abuse.
- It has been argued that the dominant sport in a country has historically served to privilege men, legitimise male authority and exclude women, and that football, as the most popular sport in the UK, has deeply entrenched sexism.
- Literature focusing on domestic abuse, masculinity, violence, aggression, sport, sexism and alcohol, respectively, highlight the probability that the interaction of these factors may contribute to a correlation between domestic abuse and football.
- There is a lack of conclusive evidence about how these factors may interact in the context of domestic abuse and football, although this body of literature suggests that the link between domestic abuse and football may exist due to their shared association with particular forms of masculinity, violence and sexism.

Recommendations for further research

- There is a relative lack of research, and in particular qualitative research, in the Scottish and wider UK context that addresses the relationship between domestic abuse and football.
- Qualitative research should be undertaken to gain insights into the experiences of victims/survivors, perpetrators, and practitioners working in the field of domestic abuse. Such research would make a valuable contribution to understanding the nature of the link between domestic abuse and football.
- Further research should also be undertaken on the policing of domestic abuse and football. This should include an examination of how domestic

abuse is recorded in both police systems and crime surveys, and how it is analysed. This would assist in ascertaining the impact of policing policy and practice on the reporting of domestic abuse, the nature of abuse being reported, and who it is being reported by.

- Domestic abuse is a pattern of controlling behaviour rather than a discreet incident; linking its occurrence to a particular football match or sporting event may simply reinforce the idea that it is an infrequent act, triggered only at these times. Further research on these issues would benefit from locating domestic abuse within an ongoing pattern of abusive behaviour.

1. INTRODUCTION

Tackling domestic abuse is a key priority for the Scottish Government and its partners. This report arises from a Scottish Government Justice Analytical Services request to the Scottish Centre for Crime and Justice Research [SCCJR] to undertake a review of research literature on the relationship between football and domestic abuse. This will inform the development of a strategic approach to tackling violence against women for the period 2015 – 2020, which includes a focus on factors which may increase the risk of domestic abuse.

There is evidence of a correlation between the occurrence of certain football matches in Scotland and increased reports of domestic abuse. There is however limited evidence that explains this link or those football-related factors that might contribute to the increased incidence of domestic abuse. The Scottish Government 'Joint Action Group', set up in 2011 to consider the links between football and offending in Scotland, recommended further analysis of football and football-related factors that might be connected to incidence of domestic abuse. The aim of this literature review is, therefore, to review existing evidence about the relationship between domestic abuse and football.

This report takes the form of a non-systematic (narrative) literature review of relevant sources. To source relevant material, a series of Boolean search terms² were identified and entered into a collection of databases and journals. These include JSTOR; Web of Science; ASSIA; ProQuest (Academic); and SocINDEX as well as using Google Scholar to access other subscription-only services and materials. The report authors also canvassed academic and practitioner colleagues with knowledge of relevant literature.

The review draws on both national and international literature, which has been published in the past 25 years, although contemporary and UK based research evidence has been prioritised. Due to the relative lack of literature that directly addresses the link between domestic abuse and football, literature pertaining to football-related factors such as masculinity, sport, violence and alcohol are also incorporated within the review.

² Boolean search terms included: Domestic abuse AND Football/Soccer/Sport; Violence AND Football/Soccer/Sport; Domestic abuse AND alcohol/masculinity; Masculinity AND Football/Soccer/Sport; Scotland AND football/sectarianism/domestic abuse/masculinity.

The terms 'domestic abuse', 'domestic violence', 'intimate partner violence' are used interchangeably within the literature. Reflecting the terminology used in Scotland, the term 'domestic abuse' is used in this report with the exception of instances where other authors have specifically used alternative terms.

Football and domestic abuse

There are relatively few studies in the Scottish and wider UK context that address how football may be linked, directly or indirectly, to domestic abuse. The studies that do exist mainly compare prevalence of domestic abuse (as recorded either by police, other emergency services, or hospital accident and emergency departments) on the days that football games take place with various comparators. All of these studies show what appears to be a link between domestic abuse and football. However, there is a relative lack of qualitative research, which examines this link. This means that understanding of this observed relationship is currently limited.

Scotland

Existing studies within the Scottish context are all quantitative analyses, based upon incidents reported to the police (Dickinson et al, 2012; Williams et al, 2013; Strathclyde Police, 2011; Scottish Government Analytical Services, 2011)³. These studies have a predominant focus on Old Firm matches (this refers to football fixtures between Celtic and Rangers football clubs). These studies are discussed in more detail below.

Dickinson et al (2012) examined data containing all incidents of domestic violence from 2003 – 2011. The dates of all Scottish Premier League (SPL) matches that involved either Celtic *or* Rangers were identified, regardless of whether they were playing one another. In this period, Celtic played 328 games, Rangers 329, and they played each other 35 times. Based upon the hypothesis that fans watching their team play receive an emotional cue which influences their decision to engage or not in domestic violence, Dickinson et al (2012) were interested in how pre-match expectations, or 'rationally expected reference points' (p.3) might lead to variations in rates of domestic violence. A key aspect of their exploration was loss aversion, and whether an unexpected loss per se might lead to increased domestic violence, or whether it depends on the context of the environment.

³ These studies discussed all took place before the establishment of Police Scotland in 2013, and therefore any reference to police data refers to the name of former divisions. All of the studies discussed are based upon Strathclyde Police data, with the exception of the Scottish Government Justice Analytical paper, which also draws upon data recorded by Lothian and Borders and Tayside police, British Transport Police, and the Scottish Ambulance Service.

Dickinson et al (2012) isolated different effects by splitting their analysis into looking at the mere existence of the match; its context; and what happens during the match. Using regression analysis⁴, variables controlled for included holidays, days of week, different teams combinations, the result of the games, and whether home or away. All Old Firm fixtures were televised but this was not necessarily the case for non-Old-Firm fixtures, which was taken into account in the analysis. They also looked at whether the match was between traditional rivals; the point in the season at which the match took place, deriving from this a measure of its importance or salience; pre-match expectations based on pre-match betting; and whether the match was particularly controversial. All of these factors were of interest in terms of the strength of the emotional cue that they might provide.

On the basis of this analysis, Dickinson et al (2012) found that there was an average rise in domestic violence incidents of 36% when an Old Firm match took place compared to the average number of incidents on an equivalent day (data used for every day in 2003 – 2011 period). There was no significant effect on domestic violence incidents when Celtic or Rangers played other teams, even if one of those was a traditional rival, with the possible exception of matches that were both very important *and* televised. Those matches that were not an Old Firm fixture, were not considered particularly important, did not involve other traditional rivals, and were not televised tended to be associated with a reduction in average domestic violence levels. The authors do not suggest why a reduction is observed, and many reasons could be hypothesised, such as the separation of partners during a non- televised football match, or the different levels of policing during this time. However, without further analysis or research, it is not possible to determine the possible explanations.

The authors found match outcome to matter little when attempting to explain domestic violence rates, even when pre-match expectations and loss aversion are also considered. As both Celtic and Rangers are Glasgow teams, it is difficult to unpick the win / loss effect for Old Firm fixtures upon domestic abuse from use of police data alone. Dickinson et al (2012) did attempt to do this by disaggregating the data into the 30 police subdivisions across the city, identifying areas as more likely to have a Celtic or Rangers affiliation. They found that domestic violence increased across all subdivisions after Old Firm matches regardless of the result. When

⁴ Regression analysis 'is a statistical tool for the investigation of relationships between variables. Usually, the investigator seeks to ascertain the causal effect of one variable upon another. To explore such issues, the investigator assembles data on the underlying variables of interest and employs regression to estimate the quantitative effect of the causal variables upon the variable that they influence. The investigator also typically assesses the "statistical significance" of the estimated relationships, that is, the degree of confidence that the true relationship is close to the estimated relationship.' (Sykes, 2000:32)

analysing the match outcome and pre-match betting odds, they found that it was only in very important games (in terms of place in the tournament), that unexpected (or 'upset') losses or draws seemed to trigger domestic violence. Dickinson et al (2012) concluded that the main explanatory variable for the increase in domestic violence rates was the traditional rivalry between the Old Firm teams.

Williams et al (2013) looked at the 2008 – 2011 period, comparing the number of domestic violence incidents following Old Firm fixtures with those following Scotland International games. They had an additional comparator for both fixtures which was the same 24 hour period, but one week later. In this time period there were 21 Old Firm Fixtures, and 13 Scotland International games.

Using non-parametric tests⁵, Williams et al (2011) found a significantly higher number of domestic violence incidents following Old Firm fixtures than the comparator of 'non-Old Firm' days seven days later, and than the comparator of Scotland International match days. They did not find a significant difference between the number of domestic violence incidents on the days of Scotland International games compared to non-Scotland International days seven days later. Again, these results would suggest that the higher number of domestic violence incidents observed were associated with the presence certain football matches (of Old Firm fixtures), rather than football generally.

There were however a number of limitations of the Williams et al (2012) study which makes a straightforward conclusion problematic. Firstly, the Scotland International games took place during the week, and the Old Firm fixtures at the weekend, and consequently the games also had different kick off times. This is a notable limitation since the Scottish Government's Statistical Bulletin on Domestic Abuse 2013/13 highlights that, on average, reports of domestic abuse made to the police increase by approximately 50% at weekends compared to weekdays. Secondly, there were far more Old Firm games included in the comparison than Scotland International games, and five of the latter were friendly games. Thirdly, the study notes that it is not known whether there was another football match (Celtic, Rangers or other) being played in Glasgow either at the time of the Old Firm / Scotland International fixture, or comparator date. The authors use the 24 hour period following the kick-off of a game as the measure of domestic abuse incidents, excluding any taking place before, which contrasts with the findings of the Strathclyde Police which show pre-fixture increases in domestic abuse incidents on Sundays and weekdays, and this may affect the reported rates. The study does acknowledge that police recorded data may not

⁵ Non-parametric tests 'rely on no or few assumptions about the shape or parameters of the population distribution from which the sample was drawn' (Hoskin, not dated).

be a good measure of prevalence of domestic abuse as it 'may underestimate the true level...as not all incidents are reported' (Williams et al, 2012:4), and recommends further research, both qualitative and quantitative.

Analysis was carried out by Strathclyde Police (Strathclyde Police, 2011) on their recorded data, looking at the number of incidents of violence, disorder, and domestic abuse recorded on the days of Old Firm fixtures for the seasons of 2007/8 to 2010/11. This compared the number of incidents on the dates of 18 Old Firm fixtures with equivalent days of the week on which there were no Old Firm fixtures. Of the fixtures, four took place on Saturdays, eleven on Sundays, and three on weekdays.

Strathclyde Police (2011) concluded that the recorded numbers of domestic abuse incidents were considerably higher whenever an Old Firm fixture took place. There was, however, variation in the increase according to the day of the week. Compared to the 'control' days, on Old Firm days domestic abuse incidents increased by up to 138.8% on Saturdays (4 Old Firm Saturdays compared to 208 non-Old Firm Saturdays), followed by an increase of up to 96.6% on Sundays (11 Old Firm Sundays compared to 204 non-Old Firm Sundays), and an increase of up to 56.8% on weekdays (3 Old Firm weekdays compared to 216 non-Old Firm weekdays).

The increases in recorded domestic abuse incidents observed by Strathclyde Police (2011) showed timed patterns, which differed according to the day of the week. On all days there is a minor immediate post-fixture rise in recorded domestic abuse, and on Sundays and weekdays a pre-fixture increase is also seen. On Saturdays, the highest number of incidents were recorded between midnight and 7am, with 4-5 times as many incidents compared to an average Saturday at the same time. On Sundays and weekdays the biggest increase occurs between late afternoon and 1am, with the earlier tail-off being attributed earlier pub closing / the next day being a working day. This timed pattern appears to be in-line with the average weekly pattern (albeit in different proportions) for domestic abuse incidents, which, in an average week, peak from 18:00 to midnight from Sunday to Thursday, and from 18:00 – 03:00 on Friday and Sat (Goodall et al, 2006).

The timing pattern for domestic abuse differs to that of general violence incidents and disorder, which show an immediate 'post-whistle' rise lasting until about 2am (with earlier peaks for Sundays / weekdays) at the latest (Strathclyde Police, 2011). On Saturdays incidents of violence were found to be 172% higher than the norm. The paper suggested that the 'small hours effect' in the number of domestic abuse incidents, could have been due to the reuniting of partners after pub closing time, whereas incidents of general violence and disorder are more likely to take place

outside of the home. A 2013 survey of 6,775 football fans in Scotland showed that on the day of a match, 62%, meet friends before the game, and 41% after (Repucom, 2013).

The Scottish Government Justice Analytical Services (2011) carried out internal analysis of different types of offending (anti-social behaviour, sectarian bigotry, domestic abuse, football hooliganism) related to watching football (live and televised). The report is based upon recorded data for all days from May 2006 until the end of the football season in May 2011. The number of recorded incidents of domestic abuse on certain days, including Glasgow and Edinburgh Derby matches, Scotland International home matches, Public Holidays and big music concerts, were compared with 'average' corresponding days of the week.

The Scottish Government Justice Analytical Services (2011) found patterns in the levels of police recorded incidents, across all four types of offending measured, with increases consistently related to certain event days. Using the Strathclyde police force data, the analysis found increases in domestic abuse incidents when Old Firm fixtures took place, of 31% on a Saturday (6 games included), 34% on a Sunday (15 games), and 13% on weekdays (3 games). Again in the Strathclyde area, when Scotland International home games took place, there was a 6% increase in domestic abuse on Saturdays (8 games), but no notable difference on a Tuesday or Wednesday (10 games).

The patterns are not as pronounced when looking at the Lothian Borders Police data. This data showed that on the days of Old Firm matches, there appeared to be rises in the number of domestic abuse incidents on Sundays and weekdays, but not on Saturdays (it should be noted that this was basic analysis using very small numbers of incidents). For Edinburgh derbies (Hearts versus Hibs), Lothian and Borders police recorded domestic abuse data again showed increases on the Sundays and weekdays, but not the Saturdays. On the days of Scotland International games, incidents of domestic abuse were lower on the match Saturday than an average Saturday, and 5% higher for the weekday match than an average weekday. It is necessary to take into consideration the different levels of policing deployed for different games, and what effect this may have on data recorded. For example, the Scottish Government Justice Analytical Services (2011) report noted that there may be as many as 400 – 500 police officers on duty at the stadium during an Old Firm fixture, as well as additional officers present in the region, compared to approximately 100 at games in the Lothian and Borders policing area. There is also a difference in the definition of a 'day' between the police forces, with different timings being used which will affect observed increases or decreases in incidents. Additional possible differences in recording practices are not known.

As noted previously, in the four studies detailed there is a predominant, though not exclusive, focus on the effect of Old Firm fixtures. All four studies found that relative to their various comparators, there was an increase in recorded domestic abuse incidents on the day that Old Firm fixtures were played. This was reported as being between 13% and 138.8%, depending on a number of variables: the day of the week the match took place; the comparator day / event; the salience of a match. The studies that used other football matches as a comparator found examples of apparent relationships between recorded domestic abuse incidents and the existence of the football match, however, these were generally less pronounced patterns, and smaller increases.

Whilst none of the time periods under analysis across the four studies were exactly the same, they all had in common the period of 2008 – 2011, which included Old Firm fixtures, and Scotland International games, as well as all other games in the Scottish Professional Football League. However, there are a number of issues of comparability. Firstly, all four studies used different start and finish times to denote a day period, so were measuring slightly different time periods⁶. Dickinson et al (2012) and the Strathclyde Police (2011) showed that the number of domestic abuse incidents taking place has a timed pattern, so this has relevance in terms of whether incidents taking place during the early hours of a day are attributed to a match the previous day or not.

The main source of data for all four studies was Strathclyde Police records of domestic abuse incidents. There are some limitations to the use of this data since it is estimated by the Scottish Crime and Justice Survey 2013/13 that only 21% of those who had experienced partner abuse within the last 12 months stated that the police came to know about the most recent (or only) incident. It is also possible that policing practices around football matches impacts upon recorded levels of domestic abuse and other offences.

Despite the limitations of these studies, they do demonstrate a relationship between the days of certain football matches (particularly Old Firm fixtures), and the number of recorded domestic abuse incidents. However, the nature and characteristics of

⁶ Dickinson et al (2012) counted a day as running from 12 noon until 11.59am the following day; Williams et al (2011) as the 24 hours following kick-off of a game; the Strathclyde Police analysis of their own data (2011) viewed a day as 7am until 7am the following day; the Scottish Government analysis used two datasets, one of which (Strathclyde police data) recorded a day in this case as 00:00am until 23:59pm, and the other (Lothian and Borders police) as 07:00 until 06:59am. For the data that measured a day as finishing at 23:59, offending related to an event that day which may carry on into the morning of the next day, will be attributed to the following day.

these domestic violence offences are not known, nor who reported them, the gender of the perpetrator and victim, or whether they were repeat offences. The potential impact of different recording practices between police forces, or different policing practices on the days of football games need also to be taken into consideration. There is no qualitative research exploring the perspectives of the victims, perpetrators or practitioners. This is a significant omission in existing research evidence.

England and Wales

A number of further studies examining the relationship between domestic abuse and football have been carried out in the wider UK setting which are of relevance (Kirby et al, 2013; Brimicombe and Café, 2012; Goodall et al, 2006). Again, these are mainly quantitative, with a focus on England matches played in the World Cup tournament (2002, 2006 and 2010), although a qualitative study is also discussed (Radford and Hudson, 2005).

Two studies both include analysis of the 2010 World Cup, exploring the relationship between domestic violence incidents reported to police forces, and the days upon which England played (Kirby et al 2013; Brimicombe and Café, 2012). Both find the biggest increase in reported domestic abuse following a loss by England, which led to England exiting the tournament entirely. They also both found an increase on the day England won, albeit smaller. There were mixed findings for when England drew. Brimicombe and Café (2012) found no significant difference for a draw. However Kirby et al (2013), who also analysed 2002 and 2006 World Cup games, found an increase also when England drew. Goodall et al (2006) report on the Home Office Domestic Violence Enforcement Campaign (DVEC) and the 2006 World Cup. On the days that England played, they found increases of between 17.7% and 31.4% in reports of domestic of abuse compared to the 'average' on the same day of the week in a 'control' period.

A limitation of all three studies is that none controlled for, or were able to judge the influence of other situational variables, e.g. other high profile events taking place, or other matches taking place during this time (i.e., either on the same days as England games, or other), etc. They did not look at the salience of the game – i.e., where in the tournament the game took place and what the result would mean for the overall outcome. All of these studies are described in greater detail below.

Kirby et al (2013) used Lancashire Constabulary daily domestic violence data for the three world cup tournament periods during 2002, 2006 and 2010 (and monthly data for 2001, 2002, 2005, 2006 and 2009). They compared domestic violence levels upon

the days on which England played (five games in 2002 and 2006, four games in 2010) with those on days they did not, taking into account the result of the game. They found an average increase in domestic violence incidents of 26% on the days that England won (6 matches) or drew (5), and an increase of 38% if England lost (3). They found a small, but significant increase in incidents the day after match day. They also found that the day on which the match took place was highly significant, with the biggest increases on Saturdays and Sundays.

Brimicombe and Café (2012) analysed domestic violence data from 33 out of the 39 English police forces, for June – July 2009 (control period) and 2010 (World Cup month). They compared the four England match days to non-England match days during the 2010 period (e.g. a Saturday on which England was playing compared to a Saturday they were not), and also to equivalent days in the 2009 period (e.g. a Saturday in June 2010 to one in June 2009). They found no significant increase in the rate of reported domestic violence on the days that England drew, but on the days when they either won or lost, they found a significant increase (27.7% and 31.5% respectively when compared to 2010 non-match days). However, it should be pointed out that the games in which they drew were earlier in the tournament, and perhaps not as salient, whereas the win was later, and the loss was near the end and resulted in them exiting the tournament.

Goodall et al (2006) reported on the results of the Home Office DVEC, the first of which took place in February – March 2006, and the second during the 2006 World Cup in which 46 Base Command Units (BCUs) from 17 police forces participated. They compared the number of domestic violence incidents during each period. Their findings were interpreted to indicate that domestic violence levels were significantly higher (between 11.69% and 31.4%) on the days of England matches than during the same days during the first DVEC (and 4.63% higher on the day of the final between Italy and France). However, the control period was in winter, and the World Cup in summer. Additionally, the DVEC campaign may have influenced either police recording of incidents, or reporting.

Goodall et al (2006) also detail other findings related to the timing of the 2006 World Cup, and domestic abuse rates. Wakefield BCU reported 313 arrests for domestic violence offences during the World Cup 2006 period compared to 161 in the same period the previous year; Swansea BCU reported a 37% increase in domestic violence compared to the same period the year before; Leeds BCU received 53 calls relating to domestic violence in the two hours following England's loss and exit from the World Cup. However, these figures should be viewed in the context of aforementioned increase in reports of domestic abuse.

Kirby et al (2013) also looked at the trend of monthly reported domestic violence incidents (to the Lancashire Police) from 2001 to 2010 which revealed a small but steady increase (also seen across the three World Cup tournaments in the period). In the same period the British Crime Survey (for England and Wales) showed a reduction in the number of domestic violence victim reports. Brimicombe and Café (2010) point out that according to the British Crime Survey, domestic violence was at its lowest point in 2010 since 2004, yet they found even the non-match days in the 2010 period to have an increase of 10 – 16% in domestic violence from 2009 rates. This may point to the presence of the World Cup tournament as a whole, but also may be a result of changes in UK policy, encouraging more reporting of domestic abuse.

It is unclear how much observed increases in reporting of domestic abuse taking place on the days of / following football games might be related to high profile campaigns that have taken place alongside. In the UK there have been a number of these, with little evaluation of the nature of their effect. These include the Home Office's DVEC which included improved investigation at call receipt/control room, improved evidence gathering, and targeting of offenders; an initiative by Strathclyde Police before an Old Firm fixture in 2010, in which 800 repeat offenders of domestic abuse were contacted (Bennington et al, 2012); and the Multi-Agency Risk Assessment Conferences (MARAC) a multi-agency campaign in Cardiff which saw previous domestic violence victims visited in advance of the 2010 World Cup.

As part of DVEC, Haringey BCU identified individuals who had perpetrated domestic abuse during the Euro 2004 football tournament, and contacted them in advance of the 2006 World Cup. None of those visited had offences reported against them during the 2006 World Cup (Goodall et al, 2006). MARAC was evaluated by Cardiff University, who found that 42% of those visited reported no repeat incident in the next 12 months, and the number of victims refusing to make a complaint dropped from under 60% to under 5%. Conversely the number of children referred to social services for extra support increased from 5% to 50% of cases. The results from Haringey DVEC and Cardiff MARAC have mixed implications for understanding increased domestic abuse incident levels related to football in the context of campaigns: it appears that direct campaigning (ie. visits) might lead to a reduction in incidents or to a reduction in reporting, but also an increased willingness to make complaints or ask for help.

Qualitative research by Radford and Hudson (2005) saw periods of 'football mania' in the town of Middlesbrough which corresponded with unusually high demand for women's refuge centres, beyond that of seasonal patterning (Feb – June of 1997 and of 1998). At the end of the second season, not only were the refuges unable to meet

demand, but the local housing authority reported that they had an increase of 100% in women made homeless through domestic violence. However, the research was unable to rule out the possibility of other influencing variables, for example, Phase 3 of the Zero Tolerance Campaign which had taken place between December 1996 and May 1997.

Middlesbrough had seen significant community regeneration in the years leading up to 1996/1997, creating pride amongst the community, and support of the local football team in the town was part of this. In Middlesbrough football has a high presence; Radford and Hudson (2005) describe how unaccompanied women know to avoid the town centre on match derby days. These seasons were periods of tension and highs and lows: the 1997 season had seen the team getting through to but then losing two finals, and a place in the Premier League; the 1998 season in contrast ended on a footballing high, and also coincided with the high profile signing of Gascoigne to Middlesbrough. As a convicted perpetrator of domestic abuse, this signing is notable.

Radford and Hudson (2005) found that the study period was one of intense and active mobilisation of masculine emotion in support for the team, during the process of which the club was transformed into both one's family and community. Radford remarked upon the language used in press releases at the time of the dramatic games – images of aggressive and violent masculinity and patriarchal 'power trips', e.g.

'Boro preceeded to produce their best attacking display of the season so far, and pounded the Tranmere goal for long periods.'

(From Red Roar, Radford and Hudson, 2005:202)

Radford and Hudson (2005) state that the focus groups they undertook suggest that the women (who were either in a refuge or were survivors of domestic abuse), perceived in football a threat against their own physical and mental health, and thus were wary of the dedication of men towards it.

Football and other forms of violence

When discussing football related violence, it is important to note that as a proportion of those attending football matches, the number of arrests is relatively low. For example, there were 5,006 football-related arrests in the 1994 Football League Season in England and Wales, but almost 22 million people attended games (Pringle, 2004). Analysis by the Scottish Government (2011) also shows that relative to attendance at big profile football matches in Scotland, levels of offending

(including domestic abuse, antisocial behaviour, violence and bigotry) are low. However, they found an increase across all four of these types of offending, on the days of Old Firm fixtures.

The biggest increase in offending observed by the Scottish Government (2011) was seen in incidents of violence, which were up by 48% on Saturdays, 55% on Sundays, and 13% on weekdays. Incidents of disorder increased by 34% on Saturdays, by 21% on Sundays, and 8% on weekdays. The pattern for incidents of domestic abuse was somewhere in between the two, with an increase of 31% on Saturdays, 34% on Sundays, and 13% on weekdays. The patterns of these increases follow the general pattern for offending in the Strathclyde and Lothian and Borders policing areas – higher at weekends (Friday to Sunday) than during the week (Monday to Thursday).

The impact of the 2010 World Cup on levels of general assault attendances within 15 emergency hospital departments in England was explored in a study by Quigg, Hughes and Bellis (2012). Overall during this period, assault attendances increased by 37.5% on the days that England played, with 70% of assault attendees being males aged between 18 – 34 years. Approximately half of the assault attendees had been drinking alcohol before violence.

Stott et al (2012) collected data from Cardiff football fans and a range of groups with whom they interacted, over a period of 5 seasons, with the aim of exploring the processes that can account for the presence or absence of collective disorder in football related crowd conflict. Over the seasons, there was a decline in collective conflict, which the authors discuss as being due to changes in policing style and police relationships with fans, as well as important episodes of self-regulation that coincided with the changes. The importance of the role of the police and policing practice is missing from much of the research in the area of this literature review.

Some research looks at the physiological effects of watching sports like football, suggesting that testosterone levels can be affected, with levels rising and falling according to wins and losses (Mental Health Association, 2006). A study of fans of two major Scottish football teams reported problems with anxiety, irritability, sleep problems and headaches following a series of defeats, compared to those on the winning team who were found to have very low stress levels (Mental Health Association, 2006). The importance of football for providing a sense of purpose, and exerting a stabilising effect, is suggested by research that showed a reduction in the number of emergency psychiatric presentations during and after World Cup final competitions in which Scotland had participated over four tournaments (Masterton and Mander, 1990). However they also found an increase in schizophrenic and neurotic men presenting before, which they attributed to stress and anticipation. It

is also often suggested that the type of behaviours seen in football spectator crowds may provide cathartic release from the tensions associated with the game, eg.:

“I think it gives a chance of release. I think if it wasn’t football it would be moved on to something else, because I think society needs this form of entertainment which is gladiatorial.”

(Pringle, 2004: 125)

Flint and Powell describe the ‘spaces’ of football as having the power to alter the behaviour of those spectators they describe as ‘respectable’ (Flint and Powell, 2011:193), through the social dynamics of a football ground, and through usual social constraints loosening. Dunning (1986) identifies that this shift is facilitated by alcohol. Football crowd behaviour has a temporal nature, with ‘shifting informal and self-regulated definitions of legitimacy and appropriateness’ (Flint and Powell, 2011:197). Behaviours that are not acceptable in other settings are seen as more legitimate in a football crowd situation, e.g.:

“There are certain things which are associated with football which are not acceptable in general behaviour, but they are acceptable there, like if you stand up and swear at the referee you’re probably one of hundreds, whereas if you stand up and swear at somebody in the street, well it’s just you. Some behaviours at matches are sanctioned.”

(Pringle, 2004: 125)

The concept of ‘permissions’ has been discussed by several authors in analysing football related violence (see Radford and Hudson, 2005; Hall, 2000; Flint and Powell, 2011), who suggest that by failing to sanction certain violent behaviours or violent ideology, it is effectively a permission for this violence to take place. Failure to sanction violent actions on the football field, or failure to sanction the actions of prominent sporting figures (eg. Boycott, Gascoigne and Tyson) are seen as legitimising, or granting permission for such behaviour to be re-enacted either in the football crowd or in private sphere. Horrocks (1995) explores the spectator enjoyment of violence on the football field between players, finding that society has an ambivalent attitude towards this violence, which permits it. He identifies that this is linked to the culture of masculinity characterising football.

Violence in Scottish football is not limited to between the supporters, but also occurs on the field, and has led to arrest and prosecution. Following the Old Firm fixture in 1987 police pursued convictions of players because of their conduct which was judged ‘likely to provoke a breach of the peace among spectators’ (Carnochan and McCluskey, 2010: 413).

Much of the existing football research in the UK has a focus upon supporters, and neglects to fully explore the work of the police and police culture in relation to football spectator culture and violence (O'Neill, 2004). Research by Stott et al (2011) suggests that risks to public order will change throughout a football event due to the patterns of interaction within a group, and is not just dependent on the presence of certain factors. They suggest that risk is a very dynamic process, in which policing plays an important role, and can also arise from the 'complexity and operation of tactical models and police organisational structures' (Stott et al, 2011: 278).

Other sport and domestic abuse

It is important to review the relationship between domestic abuse and other forms of sport to gain a broader understanding of the relationship between domestic abuse and football. For example, South Wales Police recorded 118 incidents of domestic abuse on the day of the Wales versus England rugby match in Cardiff in 2009, an increase of 79% from the 66 incidents of domestic abuse from the same period the week before (Alcohol Concern Cymru, 2010). Other research examining the link between domestic abuse and sport has been conducted primarily in the US.

These US studies, again mainly quantitative, have examined the link between domestic abuse and American Football (White, Katz and Scarborough, 1992; Sachs and Chu, 2000; Card and Dahl, 2011; Gantz, 2006). American Football has been the most popular sport in the United States for over 30 years (Harris Poll, 2014), with 34% choosing it as their favourite compared to just 2% for soccer. As such it is natural that there has been more research carried out upon this sport than others, but it is also important to look at this in relation to domestic abuse, as it has been argued that 'the dominant and most popular sport in every country has historically maintained male privilege and systematically excluded women' (Spandler and McKeown, 2012: 391). The studies carried out (described below in more detail) all indicate a relationship between NFL games and domestic violence, with differing results regarding the effect of outcome and salience of the game.

Gantz et al (2006) analysed police recorded domestic violence incidents taken from 15 cities with NFL teams over a six year period, during which there were 1,155 NFL games. Their analysis suggested that domestic violence in a city increased both when the local team played, and during the final, the Superbowl (whether or not there was local allegiance to the two competing teams). The Superbowl was seen to result in an average increase of 244 domestic violence incidents per city. The authors discuss the fact that the Superbowl is not only the last game of the season, but is a public holiday so other factors, such as people being cooped up together, it being winter and lots of alcohol being consumed, may contribute.

White, Katz and Scarborough (1992) found that the frequency of women being admitted to hospital for injuries from violent assaults increased when the local team won (in this case either Washington D.C. or Redskins). Sachs and Chu (2000) analysed professional football games and domestic violence over two seasons in LA, also interpreting its results as supporting the hypothesis that domestic violence may increase when one's team wins.

Conversely, Card and Dahl, (2011), analysing data from over 750 city and county police agencies over a 12 year period, found a 10% increase in recorded domestic violence incidents when a NFL home team lost – but only if it was an unexpected loss. If the loss had been predicted, or was expected to be close, there was very little increase. The increases in violence were concentrated in a narrow time window around the end of the game “as might be expected if the violence is due to transitory emotional shocks.” (p.105). Upset wins (when the home team was expected to lose) did not appear to result in an increase in incidents, and interestingly they found upset losses to have no significant effect on away-from-home violence.

Research suggests that the salience of a game can have an effect upon domestic abuse, with particularly important games, or those against a traditional rival, being associated with an increase in domestic abuse. Card and Dahl (2011) found that this was again related to losses that were unexpected, resulting in an emotional cue, concluding that a strong attachment to local teams is relevant. Gantz et al (2006) found that as games become more important and are more likely to elicit anxiety, domestic violence increases, with notable immediate as well as delayed (three day) effects.

These studies are not without their limitations, but they do lend support to the idea that high profile sporting events may be linked with collective patterns of violence in a community, and, in particular, to patterns of violence against women.

Other sport and violence

As discussed in earlier sections, the significance of a match outcome has been suggested in relation to sport and violence, with some studies finding an increase in violent offending related to winning (Sivarajasingam et al, 2005; Moore et al, 2007). Sivarajasingham et al (2005) found that international rugby and football matches that were won by Wales were significantly associated with emergency department assault related injury attendances. Matches that took place at weekends were also found to be associated with an increase. They did not find any difference related to sport type.

Moore et al (2007) also found that team success, not failure, for the Wales rugby team appeared to increase aggression in their supporters. Supporters were questioned before and after the game, and those whose team had either won or drawn reported feeling more aggressive than those questioned before the match. The authors suggest that winning may result in feelings of increased self-confidence, assertiveness and patriotism. They concluded that post-match alcohol consumption was perhaps driven by increased levels of aggression, not celebration. They also acknowledged that the increased aggression may have arisen from winning, or from increased alcohol consumption during the game, or a combination of both.

Several US studies and authors suggest that watching televised violence, including violent sports, has the effect of enhancing aggression in viewers rather than reducing it (Gunter, 2006; Johnson and Schiappa, 2010; Sabo et al, 2000). A study of college students identified a 'hypermasculine' persona with which televised sports viewing seems to be associated', in both males and females (Johnson and Schiappa, 2010: 69). There was some evidence that more violent sports (such as Ultimate Fighting Championships) were associated with a greater number of the attitudes connected to hegemonic masculinity⁷, with an emphasis on sports that involved non scripted violence. In their qualitative study of 18 women subjected to domestic violence during or following their partner watching televised sports, Sabo et al (2000) reported interestingly that only two of the women mentioned other, non-sport television content that appeared to trigger violence in their partner.

Research suggests that the televised viewing of sports where violence takes place but is non scripted (such as boxing, football and hockey) may lead to greater hostility and increased violent outcomes in spectators than sports where it is scripted (such as professional wrestling) (Westerman and Tamborini, 2010; Johnson and Schiappa, 2010). Roberts and Benjamin (2000) point out that spectator violence is more common in Europe than in North America, with football, which has a highly punitive attitude towards violence on the field, is the sport that is most associated with this, where as in sports that are more permissive of aggressive behaviour (such as hockey, or rugby) result in less. The need has been suggested (e.g. Westerman and Tamborini, 2010) for more research to identify whether it is the occurrence of violent behaviour in a sport that is unaccepting of this, that may lead to more aggressive outcomes in spectators, as compared to sport where violence is an acceptable part of proceedings. Gunter (2006) suggested that the enjoyment of

⁷ The term 'hegemonic masculinity' refers to the dominant, idealised form of masculinity within a society, which takes ascendancy over other, subordinated forms of masculinity, and over women. It provides a normative model which pervades both public and private life (Messerchmidt, 1993; Walkate, 1995).

watching violent sports may arise from the cathartic experience, and of an opportunity to identify with a display of power.

In their study of college football games and crime (assaults, vandalism, arrests for disorderly and alcohol related offenses), Rees and Schnepel (2009) found that it was upsets (unmet expectations) that were associated with the largest increase in the number of offences, rather than the loss itself. They interpreted this to suggest that offences related to college football games cannot simply be explained by the viewing of violence on the field, but that it relates to the behaviour of spectators when their expectations are not met. Although participation in sport is sometimes heralded as a way to 'let off steam' (Ryder, 1992), participation in contact sports, such as American football, were found to be positively associated with male fighting (outside of the game), with those whose friends also play football more likely to fight than other males (Kreager, 2007).

Alcohol

The role of alcohol in the link between domestic abuse and football has been subject to debate. Alcohol is a feature of both football spectatorship and sponsorship, and it has also been identified as a contributory factor in domestic abuse. Where research studies have documented an increase in reports of domestic abuse at the time of football matches, this increase is heightened when matches occur at weekends (Goodall et al, 2006; Kirby et al, 2013; Strathclyde Police, 2011). Alcohol consumption in general has been found to increase at weekends, during the summer, and on public holidays (e.g. Lloyd et al, 2012), which also has relevance for the timing of big sporting events. For example, Carlsberg, the official England football team sponsor, expected an extra 21 million pints to be drunk during the 2010 World Cup (Alcohol Concern Cymru, 2010). Moreover, traditional masculinities, which are associated with domestic violence, are often portrayed in alcohol advertising (Towns et al, 2012).

In the UK context, a number of studies show the involvement of alcohol at big sporting events with links to assault and injury. Crawford et al (2001) analysed attendance to crowd doctors at Celtic Park over one season, finding that alcohol was a major contributing factor in at least 20% of cases. Similarly, in a survey of 15 Accident and Emergency departments in England, approximately half of those attending during the 2010 World Cup for assault injuries were found to have been drinking alcohol before the violence took place (Quigg et al, 2012). Moore et al (2007) studied rugby matches in Wales and intention to drink alcohol and aggression, finding that that team success rather than failure may increase

aggression, and that it is this aggression, not celebration, may drive post-match alcohol consumption.

Much research indicates that where domestic abuse exists, alcohol is often also involved (Peralta et al, 2010; Galvani 2010; McMurrin and Gilchrist, 2008, McKinney et al, 2010). More than any other substance, alcohol has been shown to be associated with intimate partner violence, a finding which holds true across ethnic, racial, and socioeconomic categories (Peralta et al, 2010). This may be alcohol use by the perpetrator, victim, or both.

Alcohol is clearly shown by research to be one of several important factors that increases the risk of Violence Against Women (VAW) (Bennett, 1998). However, there is no evidence to suggest that alcohol causes domestic abuse; the relationship between alcohol and domestic abuse is complex and multi-dimensional. For example, different types of drinking patterns and habits have been shown to present differing risk factors for domestic abuse. 'Problem drinking' is more likely to have an association than drinking per se; binge or heavy drinking have been found to be more associated with aggression than frequency of drinking (Foran and O'Leary, 2008).

The specific link between alcohol, sporting events, and domestic violence or VAW has also been explored to a certain extent. Data from the World Cup DVEC in England and Wales indicated that where influence of alcohol was recorded, 40% of offenders were under the influence, and just over 20% of victims, although, notably in 32% of incidents neither party was under the influence of drugs or alcohol (Goodall et al, 2006). In their analysis of 750 police agencies recorded data on domestic violence over a 12 year period, Card and Dahl (2011) found that alcohol was documented to be suspected as having been a contributing factor in 20% of the cases. However, this was limited to a single question regarding whether the perpetrator had used either *shortly before* the incident, leaving the other 80% of cases ambiguous as to whether it had played a role. In-depth interviews with women who had experienced domestic violence during / after their partners had viewed televised sports showed that the majority indicated that the attack had been at least partly prompted by alcohol and drug use (Sabo et al, 2000).

It has been suggested that the cognitive and somatic anxiety linked to sports spectatorship increases with intoxication, lowering the ability to cope appropriately with feelings of frustration and agitation (Sabo et al, 2000), which may result in aggression, including domestic violence, for those who are prone to violence. However this idea of 'losing control' due to alcohol is often used by perpetrators as a way of excusing domestic abuse (Sabo et al, 2014; Foran and O'Leary, 2008;

McMurrin and Gilchrist, 2006). The notion that domestic abuse occurs when perpetrators lose control is also at odds with the understanding that domestic abuse occurs within the context of 'coercive control' (Stark, 2007). It is possible, however, that domestic abuse incidents perpetrated under the influence of alcohol are more likely to come to the attention of the police due to greater severity of injury or public disturbance.

Making the links between domestic abuse and football

The research evidence reviewed in this report indicates that there are correlations between domestic abuse and football, football and violence, domestic abuse and other forms of sport, and that alcohol is a factor within these relationships. There is a relative lack of research literature that explains the link between domestic abuse and football, although a body of literature suggests that this link may exist due to domestic abuse and football's shared association with particular forms of masculinity, violence and sexism. Literature which explores the relationship between these issues is discussed below.

Masculinity and violence

Domestic abuse is widely understood to be a gendered phenomenon. It is experienced primarily, although not exclusively, by women and mainly perpetrated by men (Dobash and Dobash, 2004; Walby and Allen, 2004). This gendered understanding of domestic abuse is consistent with the UN definition of violence against women and the Scottish Government's approach to domestic abuse.

'Domestic abuse is associated with broader gender inequality and should be understood in its historical context, whereby societies have given greater status, wealth, influence, control and power to men. It is part of a range of behaviours constituting male abuse of power, and is linked to other forms of male violence.'

(Scottish Government, 2000)

Many writers have made the connections between the associations of men, masculinity and the perpetration of physical violence (see Connell, 1995; Messerschmidt, 2000; Stouder, 2006; Totten, 2003), deconstructing the assumptions that such behaviour is 'natural'. Violence is predominantly committed by men, leading to competing theories regarding the creation of a gendered (male) identity through the perpetration of violence. For Connell,

“‘Masculinity’, to the extent that the term can be briefly identified at all, is simultaneously a place in gender relations, the practices through which men and women engage that place in gender, and the effects of these practices in bodily experience, personality and culture.”

(Connell, 1995: 71)

It has been suggested that rather than violence being seen as ‘doing masculinity’, or as a natural expression of masculinity, it is instead an attempt to reconstruct a threatened, contested or unstable masculinity (see Anderson and Umberson, 2001). Sabo et al (2000) conclude that such violence is not uncontrolled, or a purely emotional outburst, but rather a device used to re-establish a dominant identity. Sabo et al (2000) reported on qualitative research with 18 women who reported that they were regularly subjected to domestic violence during and/or shortly after televised sporting events. Their partners were described as ‘deep fans’ of the sport they were watching, most commonly American Football, hockey and basketball. Some women felt that the violence was related to particular sports, or to sports seasons, and others to losing a match:

“The game wasn't going well so he came home. He said he was going to do to me what was done to the players. He said I deserved it. He split my lip, broke my nose, fractured my ribs.’ ‘Now it happens weekly during football season, then there's a break, and the weekly attacks start up again with basketball [season]. If he understood hockey, it would be even worse.”

(Sabo et al, 2000: 3)

The women interviewed saw masculinity as a key and central contributor, with the viewing of sports as a way for their partners to ‘*express, reaffirm, and act out their masculine identity*’ (Sabo et al, 2000:18). They talked of their partner idolising aggressive athletes, being fascinated and stimulated by the aggressive acts viewed, and modelling themselves upon their aggressive and controlling behaviours. Several women felt that their partners identified with the male athletes: ‘*If they do badly, he feels terribly frustrated, as if it's happening to him.*’ (Sabo et al, 2000:15). This is not a simple relationship: it may be that it is the aggression in sports that attracts some men to watching them in the first place. Several factors were also identified in this study, such as alcohol and drug use and gambling, that are also commonly associated with domestic abuse.

Creating masculine identities through football

Sports are often microcosms of gender relations and of the hierarchies and regimes in wider societies, with sport ‘widely acknowledged to be the most visible display of a masculine culture’ (Crossett, 2012: 5). The institution of sport is one where gender

relations are actively constructed, and where gender is more naturalized than any other (Anderson, 2008).

Welch (1997) suggests that modern team sports for men developed as a response to 'traditional patriarchal forms of masculinity' (1997:21) being threatened by significant changes in society. Combative sports were a means by which men could still express a masculinity that involved dominance and physical strength over opponents. Other authors support this view that sport is used by men to construct, maintain or re-establish their masculine identities (Anderson and Umberson, 2001; Crossett, 2012; Sabo et al, 2000; Spandler and McKeown, 2012).

The aspects of masculine identities displayed in sport include the tolerance of pain and intolerance of being a 'sissy'; the strategies of control and dominance that players learn are the most important to their success; a separation from women, apart from the locker room culture which encourages and celebrates the sexual conquest of women (Kidd, 2013; Connell, 2000).

A body of research explores the particular importance of football for creating and enhancing a sense of identity – particularly masculine identity (eg. Stott et al, 2008), with membership of certain social categories as an important part of self-identity, or self-concept. This is particularly pertinent in the current context due to the salience of football within Scotland and the wider UK context.

In the UK, football plays a major cultural role, with approximately 29 million people every year attending live football matches, in addition to the millions watching on television (Mental Health Foundation, 2006). In a survey of 6,775 football fans in Scotland (Repucom 2013), reasons given for supporting a team were local affiliation, or parental / family encouragement. Fans said that they had a very strong emotional connection with their club, that it was part of their life. Further, the Sir Norman Chester Centre for Football Research (2006) reported on a study in which 25% of individuals who said they would describe themselves as a football fan said it was one of the most important things in their lives. Football may act to unite a community, and to provide a common purpose and identity to individuals, that few other social institutions or manifestations can match (Bradley, 2008; Spandler and McKeown, 2012).

Sexism within football

The consumption of sport has also traditionally been mainly a 'male preserve' (Messner 2012: 118); this is particularly true of football. It has been argued that the dominant sport in a country has historically served to privilege men, legitimise male

authority and exclude women, and that football, as the most popular sport in the UK, has deeply entrenched sexism (Spandler and McKeown, 2012).

As traditional gender roles and sexism have been increasingly challenged in society, the institution of sport has become one of the last and few places where sexism and male domination are concentrated (Spandler and McKeown, 2012). Kidd (2013) describes how sports originated as exclusive to males, with females having to struggle to be included at any level. However, the involvement of women within male professional football in the UK has increased, albeit very slowly, since the mid 1960s (Williams and Woodhouse, 1991). The fanbase still is dominated by men. A survey of 6,775 football fans in Scotland showed that just 5% were female (Repucom, 2013).

The Thatcherite government of the 1980s campaigned to involve more families and women at football games as a response to football hooliganism. However, this served partly to reinforce traditional gender differences within football, with women being drawn in to calm and counteract the violence of men (Radford and Hudson, 2005; Spandler and McKeown, 2012). Jones (2006) describes how the makeup of football fans has changed in the last 25 years, with more women, more black and Asian fans, more upper-middle income, more lesbian and gay women and men attendees. Recent survey responses showed that in Scotland, just under a quarter of those attending football matches go with their spouse or children (Repucom, 2013).

In qualitative research with 38 female football fans, Jones (2006), found that the type of sexism encountered by female spectators includes them being discouraged from commenting on the game due to their supposed lack of knowledge; being told that their ticket is a wasted one; or being verbally or physically harassed. The majority interviewed found ways to excuse the sexism encountered and found humour in it, with some accepting the gender stereotypes, e.g. '*..runs like a woman [because it looks like] he has a handbag on his arm.*'. Whilst some did find observed behaviours sexist, they also found them funny, although some were anxious about sexist displays and comments, even when not directed at them, as it served to highlight their own gender.

Williams and Woodhouse (1991) describe the casual sexism during the 1990 World Cup finals, as an 'unholy triumvirate' consisting of the 'birds, betting and booze' (p.86) of football parlance. Sexism at football games is often dismissed as a joke, or humorous, as part of a carnivalesque atmosphere (Jones 2006; Kidd, 2013). Qualitative research showed this attitude is sometimes also held by female football spectators (Jones, 2006).

REPORT No.6 /2014 Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

It has been argued that the orthodox masculinity which is constructed within sport helps to reproduce patriarchy through the sexist, anti-feminine attitudes which are displayed in its practices and language (see Anderson, 2008; Spandler and McKeown, 2012; Sabo et al, 2000; Crossett, 2012). These masculine norms are maintained through practices such as chanting, football talk and the language used by sports journalists (Spandler and McKeown, 2012), which have been described as characterised by sexism or aggression.

Kidd (2013) discusses how words such as 'jock', 'suck' and 'sissy' reinforce the image of tough males succeeding in sport, with 'tomboy' masculinising any girl who might be good at sports. Jones (2006) and Williams and Woodhouse (1991) talk of the feminisation, or homophobic name calling, of players whose behaviour, whether on or off the field, fails to live up to the masculine norms of the culture: eg. '*playing like girls*'. Players are sometimes abused with references to their wives or girlfriends, with the aim of distracting the player (Jones, 2006).

The language used in sports journalism for explaining and excusing the transgressions of famous male athletes mean that sports journalism plays a reproductive role in the politics of sport and problems of social inequalities (Messner 2012). A 'language of redemption' (Messner, 2012:117) is used, for example, describing the domestic violence perpetrated by the boxer Sugar Ray Leonard, as 'mistakes' with drugs and alcohol.

Recommendations for future research

- There is a relative lack of research in the Scottish and wider UK context that addresses the relationship between domestic abuse and football. A broader body of literature explores the relationship between domestic abuse and sport. However, this literature is largely US based and there are, therefore, limitations to applying these findings within a Scottish cultural context.
- Studies that specifically address domestic abuse and football in Scotland have adopted a quantitative approach, which primarily measures whether reports of domestic abuse made to the police increase on football match days. There is a consensus among these studies that there is a correlation between increased reports of domestic abuse and football matches, but there is a lack of qualitative research that explores the nature of this link between in any detail.
- The findings of these quantitative studies are valuable although they are subject to a number of limitations. Firstly, they rely upon reports of domestic

abuse made to the authorities when the majority of domestic abuse goes unreported. Secondly, the volume of domestic abuse incidents reported to the police rises by approximately 50% at weekends compared to during the week; this may lead to the correlation between domestic abuse and football being overstated when matches occur at the weekend; thirdly, these studies do not take account of how policing practices around football matches may impact upon the number of incidents reported; and finally, the quantitative nature of these studies means that they are limited in their capacity to explain the observed correlation between domestic abuse and football.

- Literature focusing on domestic abuse, masculinity, violence, aggression, sport (including football), sexism and alcohol, respectively, highlight the probability that the interaction of these factors may contribute to a correlation between domestic abuse and football. However, there is a lack of conclusive evidence about how these factors may interact in the context domestic abuse and football.
- Qualitative research should be undertaken to gain insights into the experiences of victims/survivors, perpetrators, and practitioners working in the field of domestic abuse. Such research would make a valuable contribution to understanding the nature of the link between domestic abuse and football.
- Further research should also be undertaken on the policing of domestic abuse and football. This should include an examination of how domestic abuse is recorded in both police systems and crime surveys, and how it is analysed. This would assist in ascertaining the impact of policing policy and practice on the reporting of domestic abuse, the nature of abuse being reported, and who it is being reported by.
- Domestic abuse is a pattern of controlling behaviour rather than a discreet incident; linking its occurrence to a particular football match or sporting event may simply reinforce the idea that it is an infrequent act, triggered only at these times. Further research on these issues would benefit from locating domestic abuse within an ongoing pattern of abusive behaviour.

REFERENCES:

- ALCOHOL CONCERN CYMRU (2011) *Alcohol and Football* London: Alcohol Concern.
- ANDERSON, E. (2008) "I used to think women were weak": Orthodox Masculinity, Gender Segregation, and Sport. *Sociological Forum*, 23,2: 257-280.
- ANDERSON, K. & UMBERTSON, D. (2001) Gendering Violence: Masculinity and Power in Men's Accounts of Domestic Violence. *Gender and Society*, Vol. 15, No. 3, pp. 358-380.
- BENNETT, L. (1998) Substance Abuse and Woman Abuse by Male Partners *Applied Research Forum: National Electronic Network on Violence Against Women*.
- BENNINGTON, J.; PARR, S.; POWELL, R.; REEVE, K. (2012) Scoping Study on Violence Against Women. *Big Lottery* (University of Sheffield).
- BRADLEY (2008) Celtic Football Club, Irish Ethnicity, and Scottish Society *New Hibernia Review*, Vol 12, 1. 96-110.
- BRIMICOMBE, A. AND CAFÉ, R. (2012) Beware, win or lose. Domestic Violence and the world cup. *Significance*. The Royal Statistical Society.
- CARD, C.; & DAHL, G. (2011) Family violence and football: the effect of unexpected emotional cues on violent behavior. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* 126, 103–143.
- CARNOCHAN, J. & MCCLUSKEY, K (2010). 'Violence, culture and policing in Scotland' in Donnelly, D. & Scott, K. (eds) *Policing Scotland*. (2nd Ed.) Oxon: Willan Publishing.
- CONNELL, R. W. (1995) *Masculinities* Cambridge: Polity Press.
- CONNELL, R. W. (2000) *The Men and The Boys* Cambridge: Polity Press.
- CRAWFORD, M.; DONNELLY, J. GORDON, R.; MACCALLUM, R.; MACDONALD, I.; MCNEILL, M.; MULHEARN, N. TILSTON, S.; WEST, G. (2001) An analysis of consultations with the crowd doctors at Glasgow Celtic football club, season 1999–2000. *British Journal of Sports Medicine*: 35:245–250.
- CROSSETT, T. (2012) 'Athletic affiliation and violence against women: towards a structural prevention project' in McKay, J., Messner, M. Sabo, D. (eds.) *Masculinities, Gender Relations, and Sport*. London: Sage Publications.
- DICKSON, A.; JENNINGS, C. & KOOP, G. (2012) *Domestic Violence and Football in Glasgow: Are Reference Points Relevant?* University of Strathclyde.

REPORT No.6 /2014 Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

DOBASH, R.E. AND DOBASH, R.E. (2004) 'Women's Violence to Men in Intimate Relationships: Working on a Puzzle'. *British Journal of Criminology*, 44(3): 324-349.

DUNNING, E.; MURPHY, P.; WILLIAMS, J (1986) Spectator Violence at Football Matches: Towards a Sociological Explanation *The British Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 37, No. 2 pp. 221-244.

FLINT, J. & POWELL, R. (2011) "'They Sing That Song": Sectarianism and Conduct in the Informalised Spaces of Scottish Football' in Burdsey, D. (ed) *Race, Ethnicity and Football: Persistent Debates and Emergent Issues*, pp.191-206. London: Routledge.

FORAN, H., & O'LEARY, K. (2008) Alcohol and intimate partner violence: A meta-analytic review *Clinical Psychology Review*, 28: 1222-1234.

GALVANI, S. (2010) *Grasping the nettle: alcohol and domestic violence*. Alcohol Concern.

GALVANI,S. (2010) *Supporting families affected by substance use and domestic violence* The Tilda Goldberg Centre for Social Work and Social Care, University of Bedfordshire.

GANTZ, W.; BRADLEY, S.; & WANG, Z.; (2006) 'Televised NFL Games, the Family, and Domestic Violence.' in Raney, A.; Jennings.B; (eds) *Handbook of Sports and Media*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates; pp. 365–382.

GOODALL, M.; TREVILLION, P. & MUNCIE, J. (2006) *Lessons Learned from the Domestic Violence Enforcement Campaigns 2006* Police and Crime Standards Directorate, Home Office.

GUNTER, B. (2006) 'Sports, Violence and the Media' in Raney, A & Jennings.B; (eds) *Handbook of Sports and Media*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

HALL (2000) Canal Town Boys: Poor White Males and Domestic Violence *Anthropology & Education Quarterly*, 31, 4: 471-485.

HARRIS POLL (2014) *Football Continues to be America's Favorite Sport; the Gap With Baseball Narrows Slightly this Year*. Accessed online [5.6.2014] at:

<http://www.harrisinteractive.com/NewsRoom/HarrisPolls/tabid/447/ctl/ReadCustom%20Default/mid/1508/ArticleId/1136/Default.aspx>

HORROCKS, R. (1995) *Male Myths And Icons*. Basingstoke. Palgrave MacMillan.

HOSKIN, T (not dated) *Parametric and Nonparametric: Demystifying the Terms* Mayo Clinic CTSA BERD Resource.

REPORT No.6 /2014 Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

JOHNSON, T. & SCHIAPPA, D. (2010) An Exploratory Study of the Relationship Between Televised Sports Viewing Habits and Conformity to Masculine Norms. *Journal of Sports Media*, Vol 5, No 1: 53-78.

JONES, K. (2006) "*Get Your Kit Off Isn't Sexist*": Women's Response to Gender Abuse in English Football Crowds. Philadelphia University.

KIDD, B. (2013) Sports and Masculinity *Sport in Society: Cultures, Commerce, Media, Politics*, 16:4, 533-564.

KIRBY, S.; FRANCIS, B.; & O'FLAHERTY, R. (2013) Can the FIFA World Cup Football (Soccer) Tournament Be Associated with an Increase in Domestic Abuse? *Journal of Research into Crime & Delinquency* 00(0) 1-18.

KREAGER, D. (2007) Unnecessary Roughness? School Sports, Peer Networks, and Male Adolescent Violence *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 72, No. 5: 705-724.

LEADLEY, K., CLARK, C., & CAETANO, R (2000) Couples drinking patterns, intimate partner violence, and alcohol-related partnership problems. *Journal of Substance Abuse*, 11,3: 253-263.

LLOYD, B.; MATTHEWS, S.; LIVINGSTON, M.; JAYASEKARA, H.; & SMITH, K. (2012) Alcohol intoxication in the context of major public holidays, sporting and social events: a time-series analysis in Melbourne, Australia, 2000-2009. *Addiction*, 108, 701-709.

MASTERTON, G. & MANDER, A. (1990) Psychiatric emergencies, Scotland and the World Cup finals. *British Journal of Psychiatry* 156:475-478.

MCKINNEY, C., CAETANO, R., RODRIGUEZ, L. & OKORO, N. (2010) Does alcohol involvement increase the severity of intimate partner violence? *Alcoholism: Clinical and Experimental Research*, 34,4: 655-658.

MCMURRAN, M.; & GILCHRIST, E. (2008) Anger control and alcohol use: Appropriate interventions for perpetrators of domestic violence? *Psychology, Crime & Law*: 14(2): 107-116.

MENTAL HEALTH ASSOCIATION (2006) *Football and Mental Health* Mental Health Association

MESSERSCHMIDT, J.W. 2000. Becoming 'real men': Adolescent masculinity challenges and sexual violence. *Men and Masculinities* 2 pp. 286-307.

MESSNER, M. (2012) Reflections on Communication and Sport: On Men and Masculinities. *Communication & Sport*, 1:113-124.

REPORT No.6 /2014 Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

MOORE, S.; SHEPHERD, J.; EDEN, S. & SIVARAJASINGAM, V. (2007) The effect of rugby match outcome on spectator aggression and intention to drink alcohol. *Criminal Behaviour and Mental Health* 17: 118–127.

O'NEILL, M. (2004) Policing Football in Scotland: The Forgotten Team *International Review for the Sociology of Sport* 39/1: 95–104.

PERALTA, R.; TUTTLE, L.; STEELE, J. (2010) At the Intersection of Interpersonal Violence, Masculinity, and Alcohol Use: The Experiences of Heterosexual Male Perpetrators of Intimate Partner Violence *Violence Against Women*: 16, 387 – 409.

PRINGLE, A. (2004) Can Watching Football be a Component of Developing a State of Mental Health for Men? *Perspectives in Public Health* Vol 124, 3.

QUIGG, Z.; HUGHES, K. & BELLIS, M. (2012) Effects of the 2010 World Cup Football Tournament on Emergency Department Assault Attendances in England. *European Journal of Public Health* 23:383-85.

RADFORD, J. & HUDSON, E (2005) 'Balls and Permissions: Theorising the Link between Football and Domestic Violence' in Skinner, T.; Hester, M. & Malos, E. *Researching Gender Violence*. Cullompton, UK: Willan Publishing.

REES, D. & SCHNEPEL, K. (2009) College Football Games and Crime *Journal of Sports Economics*, 10:68.

REPUCOM (2013) *National Football Survey* Repucom.

ROBERTS, J., & BENJAMIN, C. (2000) Spectator Violence in Sports: A North American Perspective *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*, 8: 163-181.

RYDER, R. (1992) Violence and Machismo *RSA Journal*, 141, 5443: 706-717.

SABO, D., GRAY, P., & MOORE, L. (2000) 'Domestic Violence and Televised Athletic Events: "It's a Man Thing"' in McKay, J., Messner, M. Sabo, D. (eds.) *Masculinities, Gender Relations, and Sport*. London: Sage Publications.

SACHS, C.; & CHU, L. (2000) The Association Between Professional Football Games and Domestic Violence in Los Angeles County *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 15: 1192.

SCOTTISH CRIME AND JUSTICE SURVEY (2014) *Scottish Crime and Justice Survey 2012/13: Main Findings* Accessed online [5.6.14] at:
<http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2014/03/9823>

SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE (2000) National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland. Edinburgh.

REPORT No.6 /2014 Football and Domestic Abuse: A Literature Review

SCOTTISH GOVERNMENT ANALYTICAL SERVICES (2011) *The Link Between Football and Offending and Victimisation: A summary of the available evidence* Scottish Government.

SIR NORMAN CHESTER CENTRE FOR FOOTBALL RESEARCH (2001) *Football and Football Hooliganism* University of Leicester.

SIVARAJASINGAM, V., MOORE, S. & SHEPHERD, J. (2005) Winning, losing and violence. *Injury Prevention*, 11:69-70.

SPANDLER, H. & MCKEOWN, M. (2012) 'A Critical Exploration of Using Football' in Health and Welfare Programs: Gender, Masculinities, and Social Relations *Journal of Sport and Social Issues* 2012 36: 387.

STARK, E. (2007) *Coercive Control: How Men Entrap Women in Personal Life* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

STOTT, C., HOGGERT, J. & PEARSON, G. (2012) Keeping the Peace': Social Identity, Procedural Justice and the Policing of Football Crowds. *British Journal of Criminology*, 52, 381-399.

STOTT, C.; LIVINGSTONE, A.; & HOGGETT, J. (2008) Policing football crowds in England and Wales: a model of 'good practice'? *Policing and Society*, 18: 3, 258 — 281.

STOUDT, B.G. (2006) 'You're either in or you're out': School violence, peer discipline, and the (re)production of hegemonic masculinity. *Men and Masculinities* 8: 273–87.

STRATHCLYDE POLICE 'H' TERRITORIAL POLICING ANTO-VIOLENCE DIRECTORATE (2011) *Old Firm Fixtures – Impact on Violence, Disorder, Domestic Abuse and Policing* Strathclyde Police

SYKES, A. (2000) An Introduction to Regression Analysis, in Chicago Lectures in Law & Economics 1 (E. Posner ed.) (Foundation Press).

TOTTEN, M. (2003) Girlfriend abuse as a form of masculinity construction among violent, marginal male youth. *Men and Masculinities* 6: 70–92.

TOWNS, A., PARKER, C., AND CHASE, P. (2012) Constructions of masculinity in alcohol advertising: Implications for the prevention of domestic violence. *Addiction Research and Theory*: 20 (5) 389 – 401.

WALBY, S. AND ALLEN, J. (2004) *Domestic Violence, sexual assault and stalking: findings from the British Crime Survey*. Home Office Research Study 276. London: Home Office.

WELCH,M. (1997) Violence against women by professional football players: A Gender Analysis of Hypermasculinity, Positional Status, Narcissism, and Entitlement *Journal of Sport and Social Issues* 21:392 – 411.

WESTERMANN, D. & TAMBORINI, R. (2010) Scriptedness and Televised Sports: Violent Consumption and Viewer Enjoyment *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 29:321-337.

WHITE,G.; KATZ,J. ; & SCARBOROUGH, K.; (1992). 'The impact of professional football games upon violent assaults on women.' *Violence Vict.* Summer; 7(2):157-71.

WILLIAMS, D.; NEVILLE, F.; HOUSE, K., AND PETER D. DONNELLY, P. (2013) Association Between Old Firm Football Matches and Reported Domestic (Violence) Incidents in Strathclyde, Scotland. *Sage Open* 2013:3.

WILLIAMS, J. & WOODHOUSE, J. (1991) 'Can play, will play? Women and football in Britain In 'British Football and Social Change' (Ed) Williams, J. & Wagg, S. Leicester University Press.